



higher education & training

Department:
Higher Education and Training
REPUBLIC OF SOUTH AFRICA

Minutes

NPPSET CET Task Team meeting held CIE, 66 Nelson Road, Booysens, Johannesburg

30 August 2016

- 9:30 Purpose of meeting and minutes of last meeting held 20 July 2016: Peliwe Lolwana
- Matters Arising
- 10:15 Update on progress of first 2 chapters: Rationale/context/vision and Development of Institutions: Monica Mawoyo
- 10:30 Discussion on Programmes Chapter: Peliwe Lolwana
- 13:00 Lunch
- 13:30 Student and community support Initiatives: John Aitchison
- 14:30 Review of Staffing Norms: Peliwe Lolwana
- 16:00 Next meeting and preparations needed

Minutes

Present: Peliwe Lolwana; John Aitchison; Tembile Kulati; Yvonne dos Santos; Monica Mawoyo; Thandi Lewin; AB Heyns

Apologies: Chriselda Mashabela; Eddie Majadibodu; Stephanie Allais; Mokaba Mokgatle; Bheki Mahlobo; David Diale, Thandeka Masondo.

1. Purpose of meeting and minutes of last meeting held 20 July 2016

- 1.1 Dr Lolwana opened the meeting and welcomed all present. The purpose of the meeting would be to engage with the documents that had been produced since the previous meeting and to identify work that still has to be done.

The agenda was adopted with the following additional items:

1. Reference group

- 1.2 The minutes of the CET Task Team meeting held on 20 July 2016 were approved as a correct reflection of the meeting, with one amendment.

Pg 9, item 5.1: "Mr Kulati agreed to do some work on governance."

Proposed: T Kulati

Seconded: Y dos Santos

1.3 Matters arising

- a. No matters arising were discussed as the agenda would allow for discussion on all matters.

2. Update on progress of first 2 chapters: Rationale/context/vision and Development of Institutions Monica Mawoyo

- 2.1
- a. Dr Mawoyo reported that she had completed a literature review on community colleges. The literature review also incorporated inputs from the Gauteng Adult Public Education Report, the Ministerial Report, and the SAIDE policy evaluation report, which would feed into the document. In the chapter on developing institutions, the proportion of students from the youth and from adult learners should be clarified. **It was agreed that** once the rationale, context and vision chapters have been finalised by Dr Mawoyo and Ms Lewin, the chapters would be circulated to the CET Task Team for comment.
 - b. Dr Lolwana highlighted that the document should also address the issue of basic literacy, since people may question reasons for leaving this aspect out of the document. It would also be necessary to consider how and whether skills should be included in the document.
 - c. Ms Lewin indicated that the DoL had had a number of skills development programmes, which had been evaluated by the HSRC a number of years ago. This report as well as the close-out documents pertaining to the DoL's programmes should also be incorporated in the first few chapters if relevant.
 - d. Ms Lewin indicated that the report could also strengthen the case being made by the Skills Branch that a proportion of NSF funding should be channelled to fund Community Colleges. The process of agreeing on the SETA landscape should also be finalised in due course.
 - e. Dr Mawoyo asked a question about the scope of the Thusong Centres, which have been established in 269 municipalities nationwide. These multi-purpose centres are meant to bring government to the people, with some of them providing computer and ABET training courses through partnerships with the DBE. **It was agreed** that the Secretariat should conduct a scan of the Thusong Centres to understand how they operate and what their mandate is, and to assess whether they could be a useful resource to assist with the building of institutions.

3. Discussion on Programmes Chapter Peliwe Lolwana

3.1 Dr Lolwana guided discussion on her paper titled 'Community Education and Training College Programmes'. It was noted that:

- a. The document proposes four different sets of CET College programmes, namely:
 - General or Academic Programmes;
 - Technical, Vocational Education and Training and Entrepreneurship Programmes;
 - Associate Professions at an occupational skills level;
 - Community Education Programmes.
- b. While it is not expected that all CET Colleges would offer the full menu, they could pick and choose programmes to meet the needs of the communities they serve and the capacity of each institution.
- c. The point was further made that CET Colleges must not be seen as inferior institutions, but as different types of institutions with a different purpose from that of universities or TVET Colleges. Students must deliberately choose to study at a CET College.
- d. If skills programmes are to be offered, there would be no point in offering subjects that would limit the general education that students should access.
- e. The General Academic stream would include the National Senior Certificate for Adults (NASCA) and the General Education Certificate for Adults (GECA), both of which should provide adults with the skills they would require to further their study careers.
- f. A question was raised about the appropriateness of referring to this stream as General or Academic education. It was recommended that for the moment 'Academic' should be used, in line with the DBE's understanding of the distinction between Academic, Technical and Occupational streams. It was further noted that the TVET Task Team had been debating the nomenclature of qualifications in that sub-sector, which should tie in with the CET Task Team's recommendations. While some discussion of this issue would be necessary, a word of caution was expressed about getting bogged down in the details. The meeting agreed that for the time being, the term General Academic Education should suffice.
- g. In response to a question about how well-embedded these ideas might be within the DHET's various branches, the Chair highlighted that the proposals have been firmly established and that issues like assessment and testing have been addressed. It would however be necessary to emphasise that assessment of these programmes should not be done in the same way as schooling qualifications. The Branch could be requested to give an indication of the current practice.
- h. The point was made that the document should clarify who the intended target audience for each of the qualification types would be. **It was agreed** that the Secretariat would liaise with the Chairperson in this regard.
- i. A further qualification, the Higher Certificate (Access), is also being proposed to allow students who do not meet the requirements for mainstream studies to access higher education and other post-school studies. The bulk of Grade 12 learners pass the NSC examinations with a higher certificate pass, which does not allow them into university study. The aim of the Higher Certificate (Access) is to produce stronger mainstream students who would be more likely to succeed in their university studies. These courses could be offered in partnership between CET Colleges and universities with support from the DHET, and would probably have to be accredited by the CHE.
- j. It was noted that the Higher Education Branch conceptualised has similar programmes in partnership with the UFS, following the traditional bridging programme model, which has been adopted four of the TVET Colleges in the Free State. The TVET College Task Team however clearly emphasised that offering courses that would articulate with university programmes is not one of the main objectives of TVET Colleges. TVET Colleges wish to focus on programmes that would lead to employment or entrepreneurship, with articulation a by-product.
- k. A further issue relates to how the Higher Certificate fits into the HEQSF. Many universities focus on programmes that can be offered quickly and easily, and have relatively good success rates. However,

there are pockets where the quality of these programmes is questionable. People should understand that the purpose of the Higher Certificates is to open up access to higher education.

- l. Prof. Aitchison highlighted that the DHET's mindset about higher certificates, which is evident from the Norms and Standards Document, is troubling. There is no acknowledgement that higher certificates were actually quite useful in the past, particularly in terms of training educators, and that they might have a value in future. There are complications because the HEQSF prohibits people from carrying their credits from the Higher Certificate into a Diploma or Degree programme, despite the fact that there are huge overlaps between the credits in these programmes. Articulation between these programme types would therefore have to be addressed to ensure that CET Colleges would not simply be a new version of Public Adult Learning Centres.
- m. Dr Lolwana made the point that although community colleges will develop differently depending on the needs of the communities that they are meant to serve, agreement must also be reached on the ideal vision and context for these colleges.
- n. The real challenge would lie in shifting mind-sets about what the system should look like, understanding where community colleges would fit into the legislative frameworks, and how articulation should be achieved. Community colleges must be viewed as more than mere ABET centres. The access programmes will be useful for matriculants who have no way to articulate to higher education. The principles governing the offering of higher certificates should be clarified.
- o. The purposes of higher certificates should also be clarified; in addition to allowing access to further study, there are other purposes that must also be understood. Some higher certificates with the purpose of providing access could incorporate academic support subjects, with only a few 'tasters' giving a broader sense of what further study in the discipline could entail. This differs from a higher certificate with a more vocational focus, where the person completing the higher certificate would actually be able to go into the world of work and do a job. This distinction should be made quite clearly.
- p. It was further proposed that a Technical, Vocational Education and Training and Entrepreneurship Stream should be adopted for students who might not be equipped or wish to pursue academic study, and who should be assisted to enter the labour market. These are occupational programmes which would not be offered in the TVET Colleges.
- q. The programmes offered could be called Employable Skills Packages (ESPs). While QCTO occupational qualifications are meant to address theory, practical and work experience, it is proposed that the practical component in the ESPs should cover 80% of the programme, while the remaining 20% could be made up of theory that is essential to the occupation. The remainder could address the theory embedded in the practical modules, focusing on aspects like measurement, weights, and engineering logic, among others.
- r. The QCTO should be responsible for quality assurance of these qualifications, and would stipulate assessment and certification to ensure that graduates are not disenfranchised in the labour market.
- s. Dr Mawoyo highlighted that this category provides the perfect linkage to the EPWP programme, where training has proven to be difficult. The assessment of the EPWP programmes could be greatly assisted by this proposal.
- t. The Chair highlighted that she tried to be mindful of the differences between the mandates of the TVET Colleges and the CET Colleges. CET College ESPs will simply impart practical skills and a little bit of theory to their students. Although this is the case, a progression pathway is still available to students wishing to articulate to other types of study. A concern was raised about the fact that by not paying enough attention to the theoretical aspects of programmes, people might not be adequately trained to become successful entrepreneurs. Programmes must contain a proper focus on assessment to ensure that all the necessary aspects of theory have been addressed.
- u. While workplace exposure might not be a formal requirement, it would be necessary to expose people to the formal workplace to get a sense of what they might be expected to do. While trades have very specific requirements for workplace exposure, the workplace requirement could be reduced by using simulations and other mechanisms.

- v. The Chair highlighted that the QCTO had been asked to comment on the proposal, since it would be important for the programmes to be formally accredited. It would also be necessary to clarify whether these kinds of skills are distinct enough from TVET Colleges' offerings.
- w. The second grouping include occupational programmes that are not available in TVET Colleges, and which have potential in increasing access to the labour market. These types of programmes include:
 - Arts programmes;
 - Dressmaking and design;
 - Culinary and baking;
 - Landscaping and gardening;
 - Agriculture;
 - Beauty and cosmetology; etc.
- x. In order to offer these kinds of programmes, institutions might need a considerable investment in infrastructure. The quality assurance of these programmes should be done in the same way as ESPs.
- y. Ms Lewin raised a question about how this plan would affect the private sector, since many of these courses are being offered by private providers. The debate should consider the possibility that courses could be duplicated, in addition to considering the availability of infrastructure and resources. For the most part it might be possible to address infrastructural needs through partnerships with existing private providers. This argument would be useful in establishing institutional boundaries, and might also focus on the fees charged as well as the accessibility of courses. Many NGOs offer programmes that might not lead to formal qualifications, which could also be formalised. Community colleges could cooperate much more closely in terms of space and programmes with universities and other entities.
- z. Dr Mawoyo emphasised that it would be useful to think how dedicated occupational colleges can be incorporated into the system to ensure articulation. The practical component in programmes could be provided by cooperatives in the community, which are most often funded by government – this should be explored in greater depth.
- aa. In order to strengthen entrepreneurship, it was recommended that the system should tap into organisations such as Rotary and Lion's Club, who have access to various senior business people who have the time to mentor young entrepreneurs.
- bb. Ms Lewin highlighted that the DHET's senior management is aware of the need to address issues like staffing capacity as well as ICT connectivity. The big issue in this regard relates to procurement, but the idea is that over the next couple of years TVET and Community Colleges would link to SANREN, and that it would be necessary to think about how technology can support different modes of learning, increase access and become more affordable. A lot of work in this regard has already been done in higher education, because of concerns about the UNISA model. SAIDE could be requested to share their thoughts on how distant learning can be strengthened.
- cc. It was noted that staffing might prove to be a major sticking point. The plan should clarify the principles that must inform programme delivery, for which broad parameters should be clarified upfront. All programmes may need to be approached differently in terms of staffing, funding and other resources. The delivery of programmes should be flagged as an issue that needs to be followed up.
- dd. Dr Mawoyo expressed the view that the principle should be adopted that there should be no duplication of TVET College programmes, such as the NATED programmes, in Community Colleges. This recommendation was supported, since it would not make sense to duplicate programmes being offered at the other levels.
- ee. It is widely accepted that many CET College graduates would not be able to find employment in the formal labour market, despite having acquired general education and technical and vocational skills. By providing this group of students with the necessary entrepreneurial skills, they would be able to generate their own income. It would be important to capitalise on the societal belief that everybody must attain a matric as their lowest possible qualification, by giving people other options and emphasising that skills at all levels have got value. It would however be necessary to encourage

- government at all levels to accept the notion of associate professions. A number of post-secondary qualifications should be located at the level of CET Colleges to increase the number of people who would be able to occupy mid-level occupations in the labour market. Public service delivery could be enhanced by providing qualified personnel in both technical and social development areas. Associate professions qualifications could cater for the middle professions in public service, for example in areas like health (auxiliary nurses; dental assistants; assistant audio therapists; healthcare administrators; assistance occupational therapists, etc.); social services (para-professional social workers; child and youth aid workers); law; agriculture; education and police services.
- ff. Ms Lewin highlighted that while there is growing acceptance of the need to expand access, it would be necessary to clarify the role of the higher education colleges, which offer a range of programmes across the spectrum. These colleges tend to focus on a specific field, such as education, agriculture or nursing. The legislation allows for private colleges to also register as higher education colleges, provided they meet the criteria.
 - gg. Dr Mawoyo highlighted that it might be useful to clarify whether higher education colleges could be linked to the provincial academies. This issue should be explored further.
 - hh. Community education is gaining increasing attention in a number of countries, as a tool to address demands for social and economic reforms. It includes both non-formal as well as formal education serving a community's needs. This category could also include open learning to educational resources, which could lead to further educational endeavours at a broader level. A range of youth development initiatives, which are educational in nature but not necessarily certificated, could be included in this category, such as sport and life skills. It includes aspects like community organisation, community development, community action and social action, community mobilisation, and democracy and citizenship. It would be necessary to focus on the things that the country as a whole needs, instead of focusing on the available mechanisms which might not meet all the country's needs. The system has been based on the existing system, rather than focusing on what the actual needs are.
 - ii. The point was made that community colleges should not be viewed as only training for the public service, which might not allow take-up of graduates in the private sector. This issue should be addressed when qualifications are developed, ensuring that it becomes part of the vision and that qualifications are of sufficient quality. Pilot projects could be used to identify low-hanging fruits where clear educational needs should be addressed and funded through the NSF.
 - jj. The meeting noted that skills programmes would be offered by both the CET and TVET streams, and that it would be necessary to avoid confusing the discourse by referring to TVET or occupational qualifications in the Community College sector. Despite the HRDC's focus on worker education in the work place, a word of caution was expressed about divorcing this category from the broader system. The work that has been done on worker education should not be overlooked; certain delivery mechanisms might not work in particular environments. Given that TVET Colleges are meant to link directly to the workplace, it would be necessary to approach this issue very carefully in the literature review. The problem is that workers are a much broader group than allowed for in the traditional conceptualisation – domestic workers, for example, probably constitute the largest group of workers yet are not unionised or given any formal structure. Public community colleges should address all the possible needs for education. The inclusion of worker education as part of the PQM, but not as a separate category, was supported.
 - kk. In terms of curriculum development and approval, assessment and certification, it was recommended that despite the low capacity base, it would be necessary to think ahead and avoid perpetuating the unnecessary bureaucracies that existed in the past. Each programme stream must be viewed as separate and must be located within a relevant structure for development, approval, assessment and certification.
 - ll. The curriculum for the GECA and the NASCA must be developed by the DHET, along with assessment exemplars and external assessments. The importance of learning materials, which had been

overlooked in the past and contributed to the low success rate in these programmes, must be addressed. Umalusi must be responsible for quality assurance of these programmes.

- mm. The Higher Certificate (Access) must be developed and approved by the CHE, which must make a determination on how assessments and certification should be managed. USAf could be involved in the piloting of the programme, to ensure broad support by all the universities.
- nn. ESPs and occupational programmes fall under the jurisdiction of the QCTO, which should develop curriculum and manage assessment and certification.
- oo. Entrepreneurship development, being a crosscutting issue for CET and TVET Colleges, should be overseen by the DHET and the Colleges.
- pp. Associate Profession Higher Certificates must be vetted by the relevant departments which would use the skills for public service delivery. Professional bodies and universities must also be encouraged to collaborate on the development of these qualifications. The quality assurance of programmes, curriculum development, assessment and certification should also be clarified. The demand and areas in which these type of qualifications should be offered must be identified, so that negotiations and agreements can be initiated as soon as possible. It would probably also be necessary to review existing curricula, which could take a long time to complete. The University Branch should be asked to comment on this issue, identifying areas where such qualifications are currently being offered.
- qq. In terms of articulation and RPL, Community Colleges are viewed as intermediate colleges and should assist students to map out their progression pathways by providing facilitative admission policies, certification and regulations. No student in a Community College should be made to repeat courses they have already completed somewhere else.
- rr. The three kinds of higher certificates which would be offered by CET Colleges should include the Higher Certificates Access; Higher Certificate Occupational; and Higher Certificate Associate Professions.
- ss. It is envisaged that CET Colleges would provide a wide range of programmes to a diverse range of students. Although the programmes proposed for CET Colleges are comprehensive and diverse, not all colleges would start at the same point or aim to meet the same objectives. Colleges would be encouraged to collaborate and be provided with opportunities to learn from each other as they develop.
- tt. The framework will be central to the work of this Task Team, since it would address staffing, resourcing, material development and other aspects. It also raises questions about how the broader post-school sector should be conceptualised, and would feed into the planning process by highlighting relevant questions and issues which should be tabled at the next TTOG meeting. **It was agreed** that a discussion document based on deliberations at this meeting would be drafted by the Secretariat.

4. Review of Staffing Norms

- 4.1** a. It was noted that the Department's Planning Unit requested the various Task Teams to comment on the DHET's revised staffing norms and standards. The fact that the staffing norms and standards are incongruent with the Task Teams' proposals cannot be addressed at this stage, since the timelines are misaligned. It would however be possible to highlight approaches that might not work, and highlight areas where disjunctures are clearly obvious.
- b. Since staffing norms are a requirement in terms of the DHET's Annual Performance Plan, the Task Team might recommend the development of an interim mechanism. Ms Lewin indicated that it is not really the Task Team's task to interfere with the DHET's present strategic direction, although it could signal how the system could change in the distant future.
- c. The point was made that the DHET's conceptualisation of Community Colleges appear to mimic the current TVET College model. The Norms and Standards should at least try to address operational issues, such as facilities, operating times, the target audience, etc. for the foreseeable future.

- d. The Chair recommended that the DHET should be encouraged to view the Norms and Standards as an interim document, emphasising that there should be further engagement with the Community and TVET College Task Teams as they continue to refine their frameworks. It would be meaningless for the Task Team to recommend changes at this stage, since a lot of work still remains to be done.
- e. Members were invited to submit additional comments to the Planning Unit via the Secretariat.

5. Summary of the Workplan

5.1 Dr Mawoyo highlighted the following in terms of work that remains to be done:

- a. The Rationale, Context and Vision had been finalised and presented at the previous meeting, where further revisions were requested. Contextualisation of the literature review was also requested. Work in this regard is ongoing.
- b. The core of the plan will focus on developing the sector, and the programmes that will be offered. Issues like delivery have not been addressed, and it was recommended that all such aspects should be included. More work needs to be done in terms of the types of institutions and the programmes to be offered, which would also address the approach to staffing, where staff would be sourced from, and who would train them. Mr Diale of the Department had been requested to focus on partnerships.
- c. It was noted that the DHET adopted new regulations for qualifications for adult educators, which all universities are presently using to revise their qualifications. Since the Task Teams are proposing a range of programmes, it would be necessary for the DHET to be alerted that staffing norms may change. Dr Whitty Green should be alerted of these proposals.
- d. The point was made that it is unlikely that institutions presently revising their qualifications to meet the new regulations would be unable to implement those qualifications before 2019. Ms Lewin indicated that the diversity of the proposed system would require a variety of teaching staff. The DHET should be given the time to think about developing in this area.
- e. The Chairperson indicated that she might be able to develop a document on staffing for community colleges, but that she would only be able to do so in October 2016. **It was agreed** that the Secretariat would initiate the procurement process for the Chairperson to start drafting staffing norms for the community college sector. It would also be necessary to liaise with the TVET Task Team on how they envision the system. Dr Whitty Green of the DHET would be engaged on this issue once the Task Teams have finalised their proposed models.
- f. It was noted that even in the university sector there is no minimum requirement for a teaching qualification, and it is unlikely that a minimum compulsory teaching qualification could be enforced.
- g. It was further recommended that it would be necessary to think about what work would need to be done in terms of ICT infrastructure. A certain basic level of infrastructure should be in place once community colleges start operating; connectivity as well as a minimum level of technology to enable learning should be in place. **It was agreed** that SAIDE should be requested to draft a position paper to identify the relevant issues that need to be addressed in terms of ICT connectivity.
- h. In terms of governance, management and leadership, Mr Kulati had volunteered to develop a position paper in the previous meeting, taking note of what is currently in place and identifying strengths and weaknesses. The M&E Policy for CET had been developed by the DHET and members were invited to comment on the document. The Task Team could develop a generic governance model which could be adopted as an interim measure. The link between institutions and local government, as well as community participation, should be clarified.
- i. In terms of institutional development, it would be necessary to take note of the current structure, as well as the recommendations put forward by the Ministerial Task Team. The Secretariat will debate this issue further before making a recommendation.
- j. The Secretariat will do further work on the programme framework that had been developed by the Chair, incorporating comments from this meeting before submitting the document to the TTOG. A page or two on delivery models might also be included.

- k. It was noted that the Councils had been requested by the DHET to review their strategic plans, and to detail their capacity needs in the document for discussion at the end of September 2016. It was asked whether it would be necessary for the Task Team to engage with the document.
- l. The Chairperson highlighted that in the next meeting the Task Team would engage with documents on partnerships, as well as on Student and Community Support Initiatives. A number of other revised documents would also be finalised for discussion.

6. Student and Community Support Initiatives

John Aitchison

- 6.1 a. **It was agreed** that Prof. Aitchison would draft a document on student and community support initiatives for circulation to all members of the Task Team by the Secretariat.

7. Reference Group

- 7.1 a. The Chairperson highlighted that considerable value could be gained from a reference group consisting of people familiar with the Community College sector, who would be able to give input on the Task Team's work. Although such meetings need not occur too frequently, they would allow people with relevant knowledge to periodically comment on the Task Team's work.
- b. The Secretariat was requested to identify relevant people who could be invited to participate in a Reference Group. The DHET does have the mandate to consult relevant structures, and it would help to gain greater acceptance of the Task Team's recommendations. The recommendation was supported by the Secretariat.
- c. It was recommended that the National Forum for Community Colleges meeting could be used to accommodate the Task Team's engagement with relevant stakeholders.

8. Next meeting date and actions required

- 8.1 The next meeting date of the Task Team will be confirmed by the Secretariat. The next meeting will take place on 3 October 2016, meaning that the meeting originally booked for 19 October 2016 should move to 1 November 2016.

- 1. **It was agreed that** once the rationale, context and vision chapters have been finalised by Dr Mawoyo and Ms Lewin, the chapters would be circulated to the CET Task Team for comment.
- 2. **It was agreed** that the Secretariat should conduct a scan of the Thusong Centres to understand their operation and clarify what their mandate is, to assess whether they could be a useful resource to assist with the building of institutions.
- 3. The document on Community Education and Training College Programmes should clarify the intended target audience for each of the qualification types. **It was agreed** that the Secretariat would liaise with the Chairperson in this regard.
- 4. The framework should address staffing, resourcing, material development and other aspects. Questions about how the broader post-school sector should be conceptualised and should feed into the planning process should be referred to the next TTOG meeting. **It was agreed** that a discussion document based on the Task Team's deliberations would be drafted by the Secretariat.
- 5. **It was agreed** that the Secretariat would initiate the procurement process for the Chairperson to start drafting the norms and staffing document for the community college sector. It would also be necessary to liaise with the TVET Task Team on how they envision the system. Dr Whitty Green of the DHET would be engaged on this issue once the Task Teams have finalised the proposed model.
- 6. **It was agreed** that SAIDE should be requested to draft a position paper to identify the relevant issues that need to be addressed in terms of ICT connectivity.
- 7. **Mr Kulati agreed** to develop a think piece on the governance, management and leadership of Community Colleges, taking into account what is currently available in the sector.
- 8. **It was agreed** that Prof. Aitchison would draft a document on student and community support initiatives for circulation to all members of the Task Team by the Secretariat.

9. **Ms Lewin agreed** to inform the DHET of the Task Team's discussions, extracting the relevant sections from the discussion.

9. **Closure**

- 9.1 The meeting was closed at 14:40. All participants were thanked for contributing to the discussion.